



Kahlil Muchtar <kahlil@usk.ac.id>

[ICCS2022] Editorial Decision on Paper

M Aldiki Febriantono <m.febriantono@binus.edu>

Tue, Oct 18, 2022 at 4:22 PM

To: "Mr. Gregorius Natanael Elwirehardja" <gregorius.elwirehardja@binus.ac.id>

Cc: Mira Hayati <mirahayati999@gmail.com>, Kahlil Muchtar <kahlil@unsyiah.ac.id>, Roslidar Roslidar <roslidar@unsyiah.ac.id>, Novi Maulina <novimaulina@unsyiah.ac.id>, Irfan Syamsuddin <irfans@poliupg.ac.id>, Gregorius Natanael Elwirehardja <gregorius.e@binus.edu>, Bens Pardamean <bpardamean@binus.edu>

Dear Mr. Gregorius Natanael Elwirehardja:

Congratulations, your submission Impact of CLAHE-based Image Enhancement for Diabetic Retinopathy Classification through Deep Learning has been accepted

[Quoted text hidden]

Fair

The existence, clarity, and validity of the research problem.:

Fair

Related works are used to create a proper argument for the research problem and research result.:

Poor

The correctness of research method and its replicability:

Fair

The clarity and validity of the result.:

Fair

The originality, novelty, and impact of the article:

Fair

The readability of the article:

Fair

Please provide a complete review about the article. Please explain the argument about your previous judgement.:

At the end of the abstract, add an interpretation of the results. So with the results listed, what does it mean for the academic and practical world?

Explain why you chose ResNet34, VGG16, InceptionV3, and EfficientNetB4 in your research. why not some other architecture? Include valid academic references to support your reasons.

Add some explanation about previous research that has used CLAHE. explain the impact of using CLAHE on those studies.

Add references that support your statement: "In performing the classification, the quality of the image must first be improved using image enhancement CLAHE."

Explain why you are dividing your data by a 7:2:1 ratio. Include valid academic references to support your reasons. This is necessary so as not to impress that the selection of the ratio is only Cherry-Picking

Please gives a brief explanation of what is SGD optimizer. And write down what is SGD stands for

Write your reasons why the values in Table 2 you chose and used in your research. Why not another value? For example, why the epoch is 16, why not 14? why not 18? etc.

Add a Discussion section that provides an in-depth interpretation of your

research results. Compare with the results of previous studies. Not just in tabular form, but requires in-depth discussion. Why your research is better? Give reasonable insight. Provide some future direction. The discussion section is the most important part of a scientific paper because it shows the depth and breadth of the researcher in understanding the research topic. At this time, it appears that your paper is very under-contributed because this section does not exist

In the Conclusion section, add an explanation of what your research contributions are from an academic point of view and a practical point of view

What is your recommendation about this article?:

Accepted with revision

Reviewer B:

The clarity, completeness, and conformity of the abstract.:

Fair

The existence, clarity, and validity of the research problem.:

Fair

Related works are used to create a proper argument for the research problem and research result.:

Poor

The correctness of research method and its replicability:

Fair

The clarity and validity of the result.:

Fair

The originality, novelty, and impact of the article:

Fair

The readability of the article:

Fair

Please provide a complete review about the article. Please explain the argument about your previous judgement.:

The proposed paper does not mentioned the reason why CLAHE is used and why there are several notorious pretrained models are employed for the experiment. Detailed experiment on the use of the pretrained models is not well described, the performance curves need to be provided. Table 6 and 7 require sort of justification/explanation as it is found that the confident scores of with/without CLAHE are pretty similar. Show the testing results using confusion matrix.

Reference is not provided.

[Quoted text hidden]