



No. : 187/ILT-UNHAS/VII/2020
Topic : Review Result – ID G697

Dear M. Suradi , H.A. Hasanuddin and Nursamiah,

I am pleased to inform you that your paper entitled “Vertical Stress Distribution at Soil Layers with Various Consistencies under the Footing Contact Area” has been finished to review. The review report is shown below for your information.

The reviewer has made comments and suggestions which might improve your paper. Please revise your paper according to the below comments. It is important that you also provide a detailed point-by-point reply to the reviewers' comments, and clearly outline how the paper has been revised. The author response form is attached in this email.

If you feel that you can revise the paper to satisfy the criticisms made by the reviewers, then please submit your revised paper by email ialt_lti@unhas.ac.id.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please ensure that you upload the source files (e.g. Word). Uploading only a PDF file at this stage will create delays should your manuscript be finally accepted for publication. If your revised submission does not include the source files, we will contact you to request them.

When a manuscript is returned for revision prior to final acceptance, the revised version must be submitted as soon as possible after the author's receipt of the referees' reports. Revised manuscripts returned after four months will be considered as new submissions subject to full re-review.

Thank you for choosing LTI Journal

With best regards,

Dr. Evi Aprianti
Associate Editor
LTI Journal



Re-review Report:

1. **Introduction.** What is the aim of this study? Need to mention clearly in this section.
Very less references in this section. In order to make this manuscript more comprehensive in analysis, it should be provided with some good references.
2. **Research Methodology.**
 - Better to provide the standard soil data report from field investigation such as CPT result should presented in the form of depth and cone resistance, etc.
 - There is no standard for soil testing (i.e. ASTM, BS or other international standard).
 - How to collect the samples? By hand auger or something? How the samples of the UCT, direct shear test, Permeability and consolidation test collected?
 - Table 1 and 2. This data is assumption or according to the original sample data?
3. **Results and Discussion.**
 - The quality of figures should be improved. Some figures can't identify clearly (poor quality). All the figure is difficult to understand, especially no mark in X and Y direction. Some curves with no legend. It is difficult to understand the shading analysis. No legend, not clear color, etc. Please improve it.
 - According to Fig 2, the thickness of soil (up to bedrock) from the bottom of foundation is 3 m. But in the Sand layer discussion the total dept is 9 m? its confusing? Maybe better to mention it like scenario # 1 consist of.... ,scenario #2 consist of... and so on.
 - There is no deeper/comprehensive analysis on the soil behavior observed. In this paper only mention the stress changes with depth, but didn't explain why it changed? What is the mechanism in it?
 - Moreover, the stress distribution exchange with further horizontal distance, why?

My suggestion, you can use references from other journals/authors in order to enrich your analysis.
 - Some comments with the clay layers. Should improve the analysis of the each figures.
4. **General Comment.**
 - When doing Numerical analysis (i.e. Plaxis and other software), the input parameter, geometry of the structure, boundary condition, initial value, etc. should be explained in the methodology. What is the assumption used in the study for each layer (Mohr Coulomb, Hardening soil, Cam-clay model, etc.) and other assumption of the soil parameters.
 - Overall, the quality of figures should be improved. Some figures can't identify clearly (poor quality).
 - Need more comprehensive analysis on all figures presented. Used references for back up your analysis.
 - Very less references. Please cite the good papers from well-established journal.
 - Check and follow the LTI template.

Kindly do English editing services du to some grammatical errors found in the text.



LOWLAND TECHNOLOGY INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL
DEPARTMENT OF CIVIL ENGINEERING, UNIVERSITAS HASANUDDIN
Center of Technology Building, 1st Floor
Jalan Poros Malino km. 6, Bontomarannu, Gowa Indonesia, Postal Code: 91711

