Date: 2022-10-25 21:05:14

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your PDF Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic

Subject: characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

has been built and requires approval

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

The PDF for your submission, "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" is ready for viewing.

This is an automatic email sent when your PDF is built. You may have already viewed and approved your PDF while on-line, in which case you do not need to return to view and approve the submission

Please go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ to approve your submission.

Username: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*
Password: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Your submission must be approved in order to complete the submission process and send the manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters editorial office.

Please view the submission before approving it to be certain that your submission remains free of any errors.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Editorial Office Staff Hydrological Research Letters https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-10-25 21:09:02

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] Submission Confirmation for Estimation of groundwater potential and

Subject: aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in

Makassar Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Your submission entitled "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" has been received by journal Hydrological Research Letters

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author. The URL is https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an Editor has been assigned.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-10-26 03:30:58

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your submission entitled Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer

Subject: hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar

Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin.

Your submission entitled "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" has been received by the journal, however, it is being returned to you for the following reason(s):

----

Please read "Guidelines" about how to write the Reference list.

The newest template in Microsoft Word format is available at http://www.hrljournal.org/data/HRL word template.docx.

The standard length of a paper is 6 pages or less. At the initial submission the manuscript cannot exceed 3500 words excluding References, Tables and Figures (including title, authors' names, affiliations, abstract, keywords, the body of the article, equations, acknowledgments, table captions and figure captions), and total number of Tables and Figures cannot exceed 6, which is estimated to be 6 pages or less. This rule is applicable to the resubmitted manuscript. The maximum length of the paper is 8 pages, however in this case an additional charge is required. If the total pages exceed the limitation, authors should consider moving a part of the text, Figures or Tables to Supplements.

Figures and tables should be placed after the body text.

Thank you very much for submitting the revised version of your manuscript.

Although we should have noticed it before, total number of Tables and Figures is 12 but it cannot exceed 6 according to the guidelines available at

http://www.hrljournal.org/guidelines

Would you please change some Tables and Figures to Supplement so as to be less than 6?

Please read "Guidelines" about how to write the Reference list.

Please do not connect the last two authors by "&".

In References, journal name should be in italic type.

In References, volume numbers of journals should be in bold type.

In References, put only volume numbers when a Journal is cited. (Issue numbers are unnecessary.)

Ex;

Wrong: Badaruddin, S., Azis, A., Ashari, M. F., Jannah, M., Ali, I., & Ihsan, M. (2020). Groundwater Pumping Management in Controlling Seawater Up-Coning in The North Coastal Area of Makassar. INTEK: Jurnal Penelitian, 7(2), 101-108.

Right: Badaruddin S, Azis A, Ashari MF, Jannah M, Ali I, Ihsan M. 2020. Groundwater pumping management in controlling seawater up-coning in The North Coastal Area of Makassar. INTEK: Jurnal Penelitian 7: 101-108. DOI: 10.31963/intek.v7i2.2634.

Please list references in alphabetical order of the names of first author, years, then the name of second authors.

Ex:

Wrong: Imran, A. M., Farida, M., Arifin, M. F., & Husain, R. (2016). Pleistocene Coral Reef Facies in Bira, South Sulawesi. International Journal of Engineering and Science Applications, 2(2), 183-190.

Kalilu, N., Sadjab, B. A., Yusniar, M., Kurnia, K., & Pratiwi, E. S. (2022). Identification of Seawater Intrusion Using Geoelectrical Method with Wenner-Schulumberger Configuration: A Case Study in Southern Tolonuo Island, North Halmahera Regency, Indonesia. International

Journal of Hydrological and Environmental for Sustainability, 1(2), 86-96. Nugraha, A. M. S., & Hall, R. (2018). Late cenozoic palaeogeography of Sulawesi, Indonesia. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 490, 191-209.

----

Please address the above issue(s) prior to resubmitting your manuscript. For resubmission please go to http://hrl.edmgr.com/ and login as an author. You can revise information and/or file(s) by selecting [Submissions Sent Back to Author] --> [edit submission].

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-11-02 03:03:46

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your PDF Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic

Subject: characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

has been built and requires approval

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

The PDF for your submission, "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" is ready for viewing.

This is an automatic email sent when your PDF is built. You may have already viewed and approved your PDF while on-line, in which case you do not need to return to view and approve the submission

Please go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ to approve your submission.

Username: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*
Password: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Your submission must be approved in order to complete the submission process and send the manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters editorial office.

Please view the submission before approving it to be certain that your submission remains free of any errors.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Editorial Office Staff Hydrological Research Letters https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-11-02 03:04:44

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] Author Approve Changes

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Thank you for approving the changes that the Editor made to your submission entitled "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia".

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author. The URL is https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal

registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-11-02 03:59:28

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] A manuscript number has been assigned to Estimation of groundwater

Subject: potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test

techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Your submission entitled "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" has been been assigned the following manuscript number: HRL22-00026.

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author.

The URL is https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-11-04 23:30:57

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] The corresponding editor was decided

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters. The corresponding editor of your manuscript:

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026

was decided and started the editorial process.

We will contact you when the editorial decision is made.

Please contact below if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Contact:

Hydrological Research Letters

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

**Editorial Office** 

Hydrological Research Letters Email: hrl\_office@nacos.com http://www.hrljournal.org/

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-12-06 20:31:27

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL22-00026] Notice of review results about your manuscript

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Hydrological Research Letters

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. Based on their comments, I judged it as "Revise (Major Revision)". You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 2023-01-15 23:59:59.

To submit a revision, go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Hydrological Research Letters

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: First of all, I had a difficulty in finding novelty of this research. The results seem to be less interesting for potential readers of this journal.

It is like an engineering report rather than an original research paper. Moreover, visibility of figure 3 is quite low and is difficult to understand.

Reviewer #2: Dear Authors,

Dr. Sugiarto Badaruddin, and colleagues attempted to estimate groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test at the densely populated city, Makassar Indonesia. Though the result shows somehow interesting spatial distribution of groundwater potential, the logical derivation of this result seems to have low reliability largely due to the lack of important explanation of method they used. Thus, to be a scientifically realiable article, considrable amendment is required . My general suggestions are the following.

- 1. Though it very important to interpret the result of electric resistivity survey, no detail explation of interpretation processes are given. Only the reference is shown. Since the maximum words for the main text is limited (5000 words), I recommend to give this explanation as a supplimental material. Related to this, Figure 3 is too small to identify the values of x, y axis and color charts. Moreover, different geological layers might be shown by using the column in the central part of each figure, but these are almost unidentifiable.
- 2. How the author calculate 'optimum pumping discharge' is not explained. But, the result obtained by authors does hevily depend on the spatial distribution of estimated optimum

pumping discharge. So, the explanation of calculation processes should be given clearly.

3. English proof reading and reconsidration of expression is required. For example, too many expression 'it can be seen' is used to give explanation of figures.

Specific commnets

Line 83 'Astronomically' -> Inappropriate expression.

Line 94 and 96 -> Redundunt expression. The same description appeared two times.

Line 118 In the '2 x 250m', mathematical operator should not be 'x'.

Line 139 - 143: In three equations, some variables without definition is used.  $\Delta S$ , t0, and r. All of three variables have no definition.

Line 168 'values ranging from 5.6 to 164.0 $\Omega$ m' -> Why this range can correspond to tuf/sandstone layer? You need some references.

Line 169-170 'it is also known...'-> who knows this? Some references or fact to show this statement is required.

Line 182-183: THe expression 'three ratio conditions' is difficult to understand for readers. Reconsider the expression.

Line 216, 218, 224, 225 The values have  $\pm$  sign, why these values have positive and negative values? For example, depth to the groundewater aquifer is given as  $\pm$ 120m. But, the depth itself should only have positive value... Why?

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-12-30 09:42:52

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your PDF Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic

Subject: characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

has been built and requires approval

Dear Dr. Badaruddin.

The PDF for your submission, "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" is ready for viewing.

This is an automatic email sent when your PDF is built. You may have already viewed and approved your PDF while on-line, in which case you do not need to return to view and approve the submission

Please go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ to approve your submission.

Username: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*
Password: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Your submission must be approved in order to complete the submission process and send the manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters editorial office.

Please view the submission before approving it to be certain that your submission remains free of any errors.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Editorial Office Staff Hydrological Research Letters https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2022-12-30 09:45:54

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] Submission Confirmation for HRL22-00026R1

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R1

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Hydrological Research Letters has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/).

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-01-05 06:30:52

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] The corresponding editor was decided

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters. The corresponding editor of your manuscript:

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R1

was decided and started the editorial process.

We will contact you when the editorial decision is made.

Please contact below if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Contact:

Hydrological Research Letters

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

**Editorial Office** 

Hydrological Research Letters Email: hrl\_office@nacos.com http://www.hrliournal.org/

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-01-27 22:05:11

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL22-00026R1] Notice of review results about your manuscript

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R1

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Hydrological Research Letters

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. Based on their comments, I judged it as "Revise (Major Revision)". You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 2023-03-13 23:59:59.

To submit a revision, go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Hydrological Research Letters

Comments from Editorial Office:

Your study may be influenced by the previous study of Anomohanran et al. (2020): Ochuko Anomohanran, Jude Isioma Oseme, Ruth E. Iserhien-Emekeme & Merrious Oviri Ofomola

Determination of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics in Agbor, Nigeria using geo-electric, geophysical well logging and pumping test techniques.

Modeling Earth Systems and Environment 7, pp.1639–1649.

It is necessary for your paper to cite the previous study properly.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #2: In this manuscript, Dr., Bandaruddin and colleagues investigate the basic structure of aquifer which might be widely underlain in Makassar City, Indonesia. Combined use of resistivity method and pumping tests, they identified the most promising area for groundwater usage presumably for the future human activity of this region. While there finds almost no scientifically novel point in this manuscript, some contribution to knowledge accumulation on groundwater aquifer survey techniques might be the valuable aspect of this manuscript. From this viewpoint, even after the considerable manuscript revision, some inadequate points seems to be remained. Thus, I have a several additional requests to authors.

## General comments

- 1. The area where the largest transmissivity value was found is corresponding to the groundwater discharge zone identified by the previous study. This might be the most important finding of this manuscript. However, only correspondence remains in confirmation. How techniques used in this study will strengthen or improve the knowledge on this aquifer in addition to the previous knowledge obtained by the past studies? We need this kind of description in this manuscript.
- 2. As I already pointed out in the first review, results obtained by the resistivity method is very important in this study. After authors reorganized the constellation of figure 3, it improves somewhat. However, why these 5 cross-section (GLP01, GLP04, GLP08, GLP12, and GLP16) were selected is not well explained. Furthermore, which depth zone is the most important aquifer might only be understood by experts of resistivity method. It's better to put the primer aquifer zone in each figure of the Figure 3. Also, GLP number shown in the Figure 2 is too small to be read.
- 3. I could not understand the meaning or the implication of three different types of pumping test. Especially, difference between type 3 and others seems very slight. Even if there are some differences between each pumping test, what this difference indicate or imply for the aquifer characteristics? This kind of interpretation of three different types should be addressed.

Reviewer #3: The authors have demonstrated the aquifer characteristics and possible development volumes in the study area through multisite resistivity surveys and pumping tests, which I believe have been substantially revised from the first manuscript. However, I would like to see additional consideration of some of the following aspects of the authors' work, as they lack credibility and objectivity.

- (1) The geologic distribution known from previous studies is described (L105-112). However, the lack of a description of the extent to which the geologic differences inferred from the resistivity survey are consistent with the geologic survey (L180-195) prevents an assessment of the reliability of the results of the resistivity survey.
- (2) You seem to estimate the thickness of the aquifer in this area based on the results of a resistivity survey (L191), but please show the validity of applying the relationship between resistivity and fresh water in other areas (or obtained experimentally) as it is to this area.
- (3) You mention that brackish to salty water was observed in the soil layer at several stations (L192), but I do not understand how you determined this. For example, there are two high

resistivity zones in the shallow layer of GLP04, but I would like an explanation of how this is interpreted.

- (4) You present three conditions based on the rate of change in the groundwater table between pumping and recovery as shown in Fig. 4. Please explain whether the determination of these conditions was statistically determined or based on appearance (L213).
- (5) You have determined the optimum pumping rate (L224), but how does this value compare (is it larger or smaller) to locations in a similar regional setting to the study area? It would be helpful to present some examples of comparative studies to help us get a better picture of the validity of this value.
- (6) Are there any data that can verify the consistency with actual groundwater parameters measured, such as lower DO values in areas where the groundwater Transmissivity value (L241) was estimated to be small? The study would be positioned with more validity if there were actual measured data to support the groundwater environment estimated in this study, such as the actual occurrence of groundwater salinization in areas with small optimal pumping (L265).

## Some other specific comments:.

Figure 1: The entire Indonesia region is also color-coded, but it should not match the legend in the lower right corner. I felt that the figure for all of Indonesia should be kept to one color. Figure 3: The resolution of this figure remains low. For example, the aspect ratio of the numbers on both axes is unnatural, and small letters and numbers are illegible. Also, the meaning of the dashed line in Fig. 3d is unclear.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-02 03:10:45

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your PDF Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic

Subject: characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

has been built and requires approval

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

The PDF for your submission, "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" is ready for viewing.

This is an automatic email sent when your PDF is built. You may have already viewed and approved your PDF while on-line, in which case you do not need to return to view and approve

the submission

Please go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ to approve your submission.

Username: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*
Password: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Your submission must be approved in order to complete the submission process and send the manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters editorial office.

Please view the submission before approving it to be certain that your submission remains free of any errors.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Editorial Office Staff Hydrological Research Letters https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-02 03:21:54

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] Submission Confirmation for HRL22-00026R2

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R2

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Hydrological Research Letters has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/).

Kind regards,

## Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-02 07:43:13

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] The corresponding editor was decided

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters. The corresponding editor of your manuscript:

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R2

was decided and started the editorial process.

We will contact you when the editorial decision is made.

Please contact below if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Contact:

Hydrological Research Letters

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

**Editorial Office** 

Hydrological Research Letters Email: hrl\_office@nacos.com http://www.hrljournal.org/

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-14 23:34:45

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL22-00026R2] Notice of review results about your manuscript

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R2

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Hydrological Research Letters

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. Based on their comments, I judged it as "Revise (Minor Revision)". You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 2023-04-03 23:59:59.

To submit a revision, go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Hydrological Research Letters

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #3: I feel this is a big improvement from the last version. This version addresses useful comments from other reviewers and will be an outcome that could contribute to the sustainable development of groundwater in this study area.

However, there are still a few unclear points below, please consider addressing these.

- (1) L133: Kalilu et al (2022) is missing from the reference list.
- (2) L203(Figure 3): The small letters and numbers in the center of the figure are likely illegible in the version at the time of publication. The meaning of the dashed lines in Figure 3d is also unclear and does not improve on our previous point.
- ※Figure S1-S4 as well
- (3) L218-224: The following is a section that I pointed out in my previous peer review comments: the authors have separated the conditions for the rate of change in groundwater level

during pumping and recovery in Fig. 4, judging by the author's appearance. However, GLP02 and GLP03, for example, show fairly similar rates of change, but the conditions are determined to be different. I would think that readers would be as curious as I am as to how this was determined, and it seems unkind not to explain it in the text.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-23 10:50:59

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

[HRL] Your PDF Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic

Subject: characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

has been built and requires approval

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

The PDF for your submission, "Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia" is ready for viewing.

This is an automatic email sent when your PDF is built. You may have already viewed and approved your PDF while on-line, in which case you do not need to return to view and approve the submission

Please go to https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ to approve your submission.

Username: \*\*\*\*\*\*\*
Password: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Your submission must be approved in order to complete the submission process and send the manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters editorial office.

Please view the submission before approving it to be certain that your submission remains free of any errors.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Editorial Office Staff Hydrological Research Letters https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-23 11:06:02

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl\_office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] Submission Confirmation for HRL22-00026R3

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R3

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Hydrological Research Letters has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/).

Kind regards,

Hydrological Research Letters

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-24 04:21:10

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL] The corresponding editor was decided

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Hydrological Research Letters. The corresponding editor of your manuscript:

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R3

was decided and started the editorial process.

We will contact you when the editorial decision is made.

Please contact below if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Contact:

Hydrological Research Letters

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

**Editorial Office** 

Hydrological Research Letters Email: hrl\_office@nacos.com http://www.hrljournal.org/

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: 2023-03-31 06:01:25

To: "Sugiarto Badaruddin" sugibadaruddin@poliupg.ac.id

From: "Hydrological Research Letters Editorial Office" hrl office@nacos.com

Subject: [HRL22-00026R3] Notice of review results about your manuscript

Ref.: Ms. No. HRL22-00026R3

Estimation of groundwater potential and aquifer hydraulic characteristics using resistivity and pumping test techniques in Makassar Indonesia

Hydrological Research Letters

Dear Dr. Badaruddin,

We are glad to inform you that your manuscript (HRL22-00026R3) is accepted for publication in Hydrological Research Letters on 2023-03-31 06:01:24.

However, you still need to work together for production processes to publish your work in Hydrological Research Letters based on the comments below.

- Please upload the Final version files of your manuscript from "Submissions Needing Revision". System Login: https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/ Please check the comments from the Editor has been cited at the bottom of this email. If there is no comment from the Editor is not displayed.
- The Editorial Office will be contacting you to make final Proof corrections via e-mail. The Proof correction is to be given only once. Accordingly, the author should check frequently the e-mail upon receiving this acceptance notice.

If you are not sure above procedure, the detail information is to be informed by the Editorial Manager upon your request.

Yours faithfully,

Dr. Yoshiyuki Yokoo Editor in Chief Committee on Editorial Affairs for International Journal of JSHWR

[Note] If you see URL Link below, you have attachment files includes comments from Editors, please be sure to download it from the link.

Attachments: \*\*\*\*\*\*

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Dear Dr. Sugiarto Badaruddin,

Now associate editor had decided to accept your article, HRL22-00026.R3. Congratulations.

Before the publication, near final checks had been done by Editor-in-Chief and Editor. Please download the three WORD files from the online submission system, and read the comments on the files carefully.

We are looking forward to receiving the final revised manuscript files from you.

Kind regards, Shin'ichi Iida Editor, Hydrological Research Letters In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

https://www.editorialmanager.com/hrl/login.asp?a=r). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.